7 Shakira, Ricky Martin and Celanthropic Latinidad in the Americas

Paul Allatson

The Colombian Shakira (Shakira Isabel Mebarak Ripoll) and the Puerto Rican Ricky Martin (Enrique Martín Morales) are globally famous music stars and, if the US English-language media is a guide, key figures in the popularization of the so-called 1990s Latin Boom in music beyond the Latin(o) American market, Latin(o) American here signifying Latin American and US Latino entities. Less well known, arguably, outside the realms of popular culture and the global music industries, through which they have sold millions upon millions of recordings, is their work as philanthropists.

Shakira established her Fundación Pies Descalzos (Barefoot Foundation) in Colombia in 2003, out of an antecedent dating from the late 1990s when she was eighteen. The Foundation's aim, as the official website proclaims, is 'to ensure that every Colombian child can exercise their right to a quality education. Our model targets displaced and vulnerable communities by addressing their unique needs' (Fundación Pies Descalzos 2013). La Fundación Ricky Martin (Ricky Martin Foundation) was launched in 2004 with its first project, 'The People for Children', which assists children rescued from human trafficking in a number of continents (Martin 2012). Both performers are involved in the Fundación América Latina en Acción Solidaria (ALAS, Latin America in Solidarity Action Foundation), which Shakira helped establish in 2006. Shakira and Ricky Martin are UNICEF Goodwill Ambassadors. On 5 October 2011, US President Barack

Obama appointed Shakira to be part of the White House Initiative on Educational Excellence for Hispanics ('Presidentes Obama y Santos y Shakira hablaron en la Cumbre de las Américas' [President Obama, President Santos and Shakira spoke at the Summit of the Americas] 2012). For his work against the trafficking in children, Martin was named by the US Department of State as one of the Heroes in Ending Modern-Day Slavery in 2005 (rickymartinfoundation.org n.d.).

The artists are tracked relentlessly by the international Spanish- and English-language media industries as sources of regular 'hot copy'. Shakira was ranked by *Forbes Magazine* in 2013 at 52 on its list of the 100 most powerful women in the world (Howard 2013). Shakira and Martin are among the top 100 Twitter global users as calculated by the number of followers, with Shakira appearing in late 2013 at number 15 (well ahead of Bill Gates), and Ricky Martin in the top 70 (Twitter Counter 2013). In March 2014, Shakira's page on Facebook became the most-liked page in Facebook history, with nearly 90 million friends ('Shakira has the most-"liked" page on Facebook' 2014). This social media influence is impressive. It is not matched by other celebrity philanthropists from North America.

Both personalities accord with Matthew Bishop's (2008) definition of the new 'celanthropists': 'celebrities who are adept and professional at using their brand and wealth to play an important role in tackling social issues'. Yet Bishop also argues that such celanthropy can be explained as a northern, read US, mode of celebrity philanthropy translocated to or imposed on the global South. As he says of Shakira: 'A pop superstar is trying to take North American philanthropy south, with help from some plutocratic hangers-on, such as Carlos Slim Helú and members of the golden Buffett clan' (Bishop 2008).

I eschew that argument in this chapter. Instead, I propose that these stars are simultaneously at celebrated and philanthropic home in the so-called global North (USA) and the global South (Colombia, Puerto Rico), and on global levels that dwarf those national locations as well. With this focus, which accepts a priori that

conceptualizations like global North and South are arbitrary and prone to collapse under scrutiny, the chapter adds to scholarship on Latin(o) celebrity in communication, cultural and media studies (Fiol-Matta 2002; Negrón-Muntaner 2004; Sandoval-Sánchez 2003; Fuchs 2007; Valdivia 2008; Beltrán 2009), and to critical interest in celebrity philanthropy as a growing global phenomenon (Cooper 2007; Cottle and Nolan 2007; West 2007; Dieter and Kumar 2008; t'Hart and Tindall 2009; Bishop and Green 2010; Sulek 2010; Tsaliki *et al.* 2011; Kapoor 2012; Colapinto 2012; Brockington 2014). Accordingly, I locate Shakira's and Martin's celebrity philanthropy in a geospatial construct, the Spanish-speaking Americas, without traditions of philanthropy as would be understood in western capitalist and state terms. I argue that Shakira's and Martin's celebrity *and* philanthropy must be assessed as related historical products of the global mass media industries, in English and Spanish, historical legacies of underdevelopment and US interventions, and transbordered community aspirations and formations in the Americas.

The chapter proceeds with an overview of philanthropic-like traditions and new philanthropic enterprises in the Americas, which indicate that while the celanthropy of Shakira and Martin has affinities with North American models, it is also informed by longstanding Latin American charitable and volunteer traditions. I then discuss the artists' philanthropic work in relation to other national and continental legacies, and to a transnational ideal of Latin(o) American identity, one enabled by the artists' identificatory connections to their home countries, the continent more broadly and the USA itself, the world's second largest Spanish-speaking country. These shifting locations assist the artists in fashioning themselves as embodiments of celanthropic latinidad. Yet, as I demonstrate, that self-fashioning also exposes Shakira and Martin and their work to criticisms about celebrity self-interest and apolitical approaches to pressing development issues, as well as about what their particular embrace of latinidad might signify in the US setting. The chapter ends by proposing that, however ambivalent it may be, Shakira's and Martin's pragmatic, yet at times effective, celanthropic latinidad demonstrate how transborder community aspirations in the

Americas challenge readings of celebrity and philanthropy as a phenomenon emanating from the global North only.

Philanthropic enterprise in Latin(o) America

Scholarship on philanthropy in Latin America (Sanborn and Portocarrero 2005; Watson 2008) and among US Latino communities (see 'Latino philanthropy literature review' 2003 for an overview) indicates that a number of philanthropic-like traditions are evident across the Americas. These traditions include: charity work, voluntarism and non-state social welfare support for the poor; religious giving, again largely voluntary, within the Catholic Church apparatus; *mutualistas*, or mutual-aid and self-help associations, clubs, and other support organizations established by specific local communities and immigrant groups from the mid-1800s onwards; and a deeply adhered to convention among the continent's elites to fund building projects and to donate resources to causes relating to children, education, arts and culture, as well as disaster relief.

The first critical survey of philanthropy in Latin America, *Philanthropy and Social Change in Latin America* (Sanborn and Portocarrero 2005), confirms the above generalized assessment in its identification of philanthropic work in seven Latin American countries: Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Ecuador, Mexico and Peru. In her overview of the continent, Sanborn (2005: 3–29) notes that notwithstanding the paucity and unreliability of data, three common areas of philanthropic attention are identifiable in the continent: education; health; and, arts and culture. For some countries, moreover, community development, active citizenship and human rights are also drivers of philanthropy. Sanborn (2005) points out that the continent's first independent philanthropic foundations, as would be understood in North American terms, date back only to the 1990s, and that they marked a secular shift away from an historical record characterized largely by socioeconomic elite contributions to Catholic Church charity initiatives in education and health.

Tom Watson (2008), publisher of the online resource 'On philanthropy', provides an overview of Latin American philanthropic trends in the twenty-first century. Some of those trends resist being aligned with North American paradigms given the long historical traditions of voluntarism, often associated with the Catholic Church and Sociedades de Beneficiencia Pública (Secular Societies of Social Benefit), and with Mutual Aid Societies that were formed by immigrants from specific countries like China, Italy, Japan, and Spain, in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. These organizations operated under clear religious or immigrant community rubrics of charity, and focused on providing voluntary funding for social welfare and such services as health and education.

For Watson (2008), the first contemporary philanthropic trend in Latin America is that evangelical Christian and some Muslim actors are now competing with the Catholic Church in funding charitable works, and providing local and national advocacy and support to marginal communities over human rights abuses. A second philanthropic trend is 'Foundation philanthropy', still a weak sector given tax incentives do not generally encourage Latin America's elite to set up foundations in the way that US-based nonprofit organizations routinely fund specific services and target philanthropic causes. Given their successes, Shakira and Ricky Martin would thus be continental leaders in this area. A third trend involves the corporate sector's growing 'social engagement and philanthropic budgets' that suggest a continent-wide move away from mere social responsibility toward corporate recognition of the need to support philanthropic enterprises (Watson 2008). Watson's fourth trend refers to the rise of individual giving as typified by the work of Shakira and Ricky Martin, two supercelebrities from among a host of Latin American artists, musicians, actors and sportspeople to have attained international 'star' recognition since the 1990s. For Watson (2008), 'Their visibility and growing wealth has been accompanied by their public commitment to philanthropic efforts, raising the visibility of voluntary commitment to community and establishing philanthropy as a form of societal leadership'. The ALAS Foundation that Shakira helped found, and whose core members include Ricky Martin and many of Latin America's leading popular

musicians and singers, exemplifies this trend.

By contrast with the scant work on Latin America, most extant studies of Latino philanthropy in the USA date from the 1980s and 1990s, and were underwritten by a purported concern with the challenge of galvanizing Latino philanthropy given the lack of philanthropic traditions among US Latino communities as understood in capitalist and US state and philanthropic history terms (Gonzales 1985; Gallegos and O'Neill 1991; Nuiry 1992; Cortes 1995; Ball, Lowe and Phillips 1997; De la Garza 1997; Campoamor, Diaz and Ramos 1999; H.A.J. Ramos 1999). Poverty, socioeconomic and political marginalization from the broader US community, the centrality of the family and the power of the Catholic Church in many Latinos' lives, were cited as reasons for the absence of Latino philanthropy (Miranda 1999). Yet, the research does reveal a long history of religious giving within the Catholic Church apparatus, as well as the existence of mutualistas, clubs, and other support organizations, as far back as the mid-1800s (Gonzales 1985). Critics have also noted the transborder links of such organizations with regard to Caribbean- and Mexican-origin Latino communities, and some have identified a philanthropic drive in remittance flows from the USA, most notably in times of natural disaster, but also as a form of binational community building and local infrastructure development (Cervantes 2003; The 2009 Index of Global Philanthropy and Remittances 2009). Yet another study notes a clear rise in US Latino philanthropic foundations from the late 1980s to the early 2000s, and confirms that when Latinos give to charity, their priorities are to causes relating to children, education, arts and culture, or to disaster relief in home countries and local communities ('Latino philanthropy literature review' 2003). Again, this is akin to the historically active philanthropy-like traditions across Latin America.

It is thus arguable to a point that the high-profile philanthropic enterprises established by Latino celebrities such as Ricky Martin and Shakira are a mass-mediated, transnational evolution of earlier Latin American and Latino philanthropic traditions that now overlap with, and are inflected by, so-called

'North American philanthropy' (Bishop 2008). As Shakira's and Martin's foundations demonstrate, the stars' primary focuses have been on causes related to children's welfare and education. Shakira is explicit on this: 'The benefits are clear, and they help us all: education reduces poverty, decreases violence, and lessens gender inequality. A single year of primary education can mean a 10 to 20 percent increase in a woman's wages later in life' (Shakira 2013). Martin, too, states that education is central to his philanthropy: 'Education has been our pillar from the outset' (Martin 2012). Both celebrities have contributed to disaster relief initiatives, for example, fund raising or providing structural support for the victims of the 2010 Haiti earthquake ('Ricky Martin and Habitat's CEO' 2010; Gray 2011). They are active in a range of arts and culture enterprises, including the already noted ALAS. Shakira and Martin acknowledge their Catholic backgrounds, the importance of family, and their middle-class origins as contextual frames for their philanthropic work (Martin 2010; Cobo 2011). Yet other transnational legacies and historical links in the Americas also ground and inform the stars' particular approaches to celanthropy.

Continental legacies and celanthropic latinidad

Shakira and Martin are actors in the celanthropic pantheon as understood from and in the global North; but the same argument can be made of their celanthropy in the global South, in Puerto Rico and Colombia, and the Spanish-speaking world more broadly. It is important here to recall that Puerto Rico is a Caribbean island with the dubious distinction of being the world's longest-running colony, first under Spain, then the USA. The latter ruler was responsible, with its 'Operation Bootstrap' modernization program in the 1940s and 1950s, for the mass exodus of some half of the island's population to the US mainland (Allatson 2007: 152). That exodus made the Puerto Rican diaspora into a distinct Latino historical minority, alongside the more populous Mexican-American/Chicano sector. It also reflected how US rule of the island was overdetermined by Cold War logics and imperatives: Puerto Rico was seen by successive US administrations as a bulwark against Communism, and therefore as a geocultural

space to be reformed in US-friendly, capitalist ways (Allatson 2007: 152). Shakira comes from Colombia, a country grappling with the unresolved legacies of economic underdevelopment, wealth and racial inequity, and since the 1960s, armed conflict involving successive federal administrations, leftwing guerilla and separatist movements, rightwing paramilitary groups, the state's own armed forces, and well-armed drug-trafficking cartels, over which the USA has been a shadowy, and at times, sinister influence (Grandin 2006; Yaffe 2011). Moreover, Colombia has been one of the frontline Latin American states in the so-called War on Drugs. That 'War' has been prosecuted by successive US administrations since the 1970s, and has involved enormous military and financial contributions and interventions in attempts to constrain the territorial influence of the drug cartels (Ronderos 2003).

In their public statements and the briefs of the organizations they have founded or been linked to, Martin and Shakira self-consciously appeal to their national origins as keys to understanding their philanthropic work. They also acknowledge the USA's role in the persistence of poverty and socioeconomic and political power imbalances in Puerto Rico and Colombia respectively, and the need to address historical legacies of exploitation in the continent more broadly. Martin, for example, used his musical status and popularity to critique US naval use, until 2003, of the Puerto Rican island of Vieques as a missile-testing site. This use was widely regarded in Puerto Rico as symptomatic of the island's fraught colonial relationship with, and dependency on, the USA (Falcón 2001; Rojas 2013). He brought the issue to the attention of his fans and wider audiences during acceptance speeches at the 1999 Billboard Awards and at the 2001 MTV Music Awards, where he stated: 'some kids ... wake up every morning in a little island in the Caribbean called Viegues listening to explosions due to some military exercises' (Rojas 2013: 501). Martin has also supported demands for the release of pro-independence Puerto Rican activists, such as Oscar López Rivera, in US jails on political grounds (Kurshan 2013).

Shakira's philanthropic sense of self is anchored in her native Colombia, and

informed by the singer's recognition of the need to address the historical legacies of entrenched socioeconomic inequality, and the impact that armed and ideological conflict has had on the country since the 1960s. The 'About' page on the official website for Shakira's Fundación Pies Descalzos, for example, contains an open letter from the star that refers to Colombia's modern history of violence and population displacements:

I was born in a Latin American country that has been hit particularly hard by injustice and a serious social crisis. I am sure that people often talk about Colombia's problems, like drug trafficking and the subversive groups, yet there is another problem that affects Colombians even more. It is hard to believe that because of our internal conflict and the escalating violence, three million people have been forcibly displaced from their homes. ('A letter from Shakira' 2014).

Shakira notes United Nations' recognition that Colombia currently has the 'second largest humanitarian crisis of internal displacement in the world, after Sudan', and that this means some two million Colombian children are outside the existing school system, and there is no structural state support for addressing the country's half-century of armed conflict and attendant trauma ('A letter from Shakira' 2014).

That said, Martin's and Shakira's approaches to celanthropy impel further historicization and contextualization, given they come to an ambivalent junction in the USA. In that nationalized space both Shakira and Ricky Martin are 'tropicalized', to use Frances Aparicio and Susana Chávez-Silverman's term, as 'hot Latins' (1997), and yet both also at times self-identify as Latinos. This identity is understood as US-enabled panethnic identifications or latinidades that transcend, but do not negate, identifications based on national origin or historical minority status (Caminero-Santangelo 2007: 1–35).

For instance, on the 2012 reelection of President Obama, who garnered the support of a majority of US Latinos, Martin said. 'As a Latino Puerto Rican U.S. citizen that can vote for the president, it was very beautiful to see minorities

getting together for democracy, for freedom, for civil rights. We are part of this country and we move this country as well. We have a voice. And apparently we were very loud' (quoted in Z. Ramos 2012). The conjunction of 'Latino Puerto Rican U.S. citizen' here is highly unusual. If it conveys something of a desperate desire to cover many identity bases, it nonetheless does point to Martin's sense of identificatory multiplicity, which can be expanded further to include male, white, middle-class, performing artist, and, since 2010, gay.

As for Shakira, the critic María Elena Cepeda (2010: 63) argues that 'through her music and through her public persona, [Shakira] shapes both in- and out-group notions of what it means to be not only Latina but also *colombiana*'. Cepeda also identifies a suite of identifications, including 'Lebanese-Colombian, Caribbean-Colombian, female, popular performer, and recent U.S. migrant', that indicate how Shakira at once embodies and adds complexity to 'a sense of *Latinidad* and *colombianidad* both within and outside U.S. borders' (2010: 63). To Shakira's multiple subject positions I would add celebrity and philanthropist, for these are identificatory prisms by which she is also 'read' on a global level, beyond her music-star status. The same can be said of Martin as well.

When viewed from the USA the complex panethnic and transnational subject positions occupied by the two artists are significant. They indicate that Shakira and Martin are subject to the highly charged racial-ethnic contours of US identity discourses about national belonging, which have long troped Latinos as somehow alien and/or threatening to the US national imaginary (Allatson 2004). When deployed by anti-immigrant spokespeople, such discourses regard all Latinos as forming a cohesive and coherent grouping. The discourses thus obscure how the heterogeneous collective communities at their heart – 16 per cent of the total US population, or some 50.5 million people, as at the 2010 Census (Ennis, Ríos-Vargas and Albert 2011) – include diverse peoples and communities with origins across the Americas, and contain significant middle- and upper-classes, and highly visible, wealthy, educated, media-savvy, politically astute and influential individuals, including the two celebrities at the heart of this chapter.

Shakira and Martin appear to have taken pragmatic advantage of the rise of latinidades in the USA since the 1980s to redefine themselves, and therefore their celanthropy function, to use Foucault's conceptualization of an author in a new mass-mediated context, as Latin(o) American artists and spokespeople (Foucault 2007). That is, their primary identifications might be anchored in non-US spaces, but their simultaneous at-homeliness in the USA as self-identifying Latin(o)s also enables them to market themselves, however superficially, as literal embodiments of how the differences within and between Latino sectors in that country, and by extension, within and between Latin Americans anywhere, can be overcome. Thus, if their philanthropic work evokes that spearheaded by the likes of numerous super-rich film and music stars in the USA, it is also informed by a discourse of latinidad enabled in US borders and activated in Latin America more broadly as what I call a form of celanthropic latinidad.

This celanthropic and identificatory combination has not been without its critics. As the next section details, the artists' celanthropic latinidad is haunted by imperial and capitalist legacies in the Americas, particularly those affecting the USA's Latino sectors. Additionally their celanthropy draws intense media scrutiny, speculation and critique.

Critiques of celanthropic latinidad

Noting the relocation of many Latin American and Spanish music stars to the USA, whose ranks include Shakira and Martin, the Nuyorican cultural critic Alberto Sandoval-Sánchez (2003) has been scathing about what he regards as those 'star' performers' appropriations of an acceptable Latino status. While accepting that such celebrities inevitably contribute to 'the construction and production of U.S. Latino/a identity and the reconnection and recovery of their Latin American roots', their occupation of that identity, he asserts, marginalizes and excludes 'other talented U.S. Latinos/as' (Sandoval-Sánchez 2003: 17–18). Similar observations have been made by Frances Negrón-Muntaner (2004: 268)

of Martin, who once famously claimed that, 'I am Puerto Rico'. Martin, she states, is so closely associated with Puerto Rico as its purported living embodiment because his US success and attendant 'acceptable' Latino status are predicated on the self-conscious construction of his persona and music as 'modern, technologically advanced, white, and middle-class', as opposed to the island's stereotyped norm of being represented as primitive, black and working-class (Negrón-Muntaner 2004: 268). Such criticisms also have in common a sense that Martin, like Shakira, occupies what Cepeda calls 'the interstices between the Latin American and the U.S. Latino contained within the rubric of Latinidad (Cepeda 2010: 63). These celebrities, it would seem, invite scrutiny over their Latin(o) credentials precisely because of their exceptional, interstitial, indeed cosmopolitan, celebrity status.

Sandoval-Sánchez (2003) articulates neatly the political stakes in the critique of Latin American celebrities when articulated from a US Latino perspective. In his words:

If U.S. Latinos/as are conditioned by the dynamics of domestic colonialism, Ricky must be placed within the context of imperial colonialism. Given that he has crossed over to the English music world, he is seen as a foreigner who has a good command of English, contributing in this way to perpetuate the stereotype of Latinos/as as foreigners and recent immigrants. (Sandoval-Sánchez 2003: 18).

For Sandoval-Sánchez, who was born in Puerto Rico but has lived for many decades in the USA, the white Martin articulates an ideal of Latino privilege that does not relate to the lived experiences of many millions of non-white Latinos in the USA. Nor does Martin's well-known support for Puerto Rican independence acknowledge the historical realities of Puerto Rican dependency on the USA (2003: 18). As Sandoval-Sánchez (2003: 18) says, Martin's 'ignorance of racism in the U.S. and how Puerto Ricans are seen as people of color distances him from the trials and tribulations of U.S. Latinos/as in respect to their economic and social inequality'. For Sandoval-Sánchez (2003: 17), Shakira too exemplifies the Latin American celebrity who provides an acceptable face to Latinidad in the US

setting. Moreover, her interstitial location between Latin America and Latin(o) America has also exposed her to accusations of being an apolitical operator and unwilling to take stands on pressing political matters such as opposing Colombia's leftwing guerilla group FARC (Malcomson 2009), despite the fact that she is on record for appealing to FRAC leadership to end their armed struggle (Bishop 2008).

Clearly, Shakira nor Martin are not 'typical' Latin(o) Americans, given their wealth and global celebrity status. At the same time neither artist has been immune to mass-mediated interrogation of their celanthropic work and motives, and their private lives. Media criticisms of Ricky Martin have been intense, focusing for much of his celebrity career on the disjunction between, on the one hand, his socially progressive public statements and philanthropic activities, and on the other hand, his highly scrutinized because 'closeted' private life, as he himself notes in his autobiography (Martin 2010). His fatherhood of two boys via a not fully understood donor arrangement embroiled him in public debates over celebrity parenthood, but not quite like the debates that dog Madonna and Brad Pitt and Angelina Jolie (Ayers 2011; see also Bell, in this volume). His admission of his homosexuality in 2010, and support for LGBTQ people in the Americas (Martin 2010, 251–78), are contrasted with his appearance on the stage of the 2001 inauguration of President George W. Bush, Jr., which sent a message of political and moral conservatism to his fan base, which he now regrets (Martin 2010). After Martin announced his desire to marry his then partner, Carlos González Abella, a Puerto Rican financial analyst and stock broker who shared parenting of Martin's sons, Matteo and Valentino, media speculation across the Spanish-speaking world focused on whether or not Martin would, in fact, take up the Spanish Government's offer of citizenship to enable the couple to marry (Galaz 2011).

As a global celebrity, Shakira, too, has been the target of intense media attention. But perhaps most telling have been media investigations into the Fundación América Latina en Acción Solidaria (ALAS), headquartered in Panama City, and which she co-founded. ALAS's Honorary President was the Colombian Nobel Laureate for Literature, Gabriel García Márquez. The Foundation's website maintains that it aims to 'mobilize Latin-American society towards the implementation of integrated early childhood public policies, so that every child from zero to six years old has access to health plans, education and nutrition' (América Latina en Acción Solidaria 2013). Shakira and Ricky Martin are 'activistas' in ALAS, along with dozens of Latin American and Latino music stars. For Scott Malcomson (2009), Shakira's work with ALAS seemed to represented a new philanthropic model: it targeted disadvantage not in 'distant lands' but on the continent in which Shakira and ALAS's roster of supporters lived. Moreover, the range of international and corporate involvement, and ALAS's philanthropic ambition, were unprecedented. In Malcomson's words:

They have a policy focus—early-childhood nutrition, education and medical care—that is on a scale beyond the reach of private charity. It requires the steady effort of the state. It cannot be addressed by rich countries' check-writing. So the trick is to take pop celebrity, marry it to big business and permanently alter the way Latin American governments help care for the young and the poor. (Malcomson 2009).

However, Shakira could not dodge damage to her celanthropic reputation given the Foundation's failure to deliver on its promises. Worse were the allegations of financial mismanagement on the part of her then fiancé, Antonio De la Rúa, son of an ex-President of Argentina and ALAS's Vice-President, and of the executive director of ALAS, Carlos Clemente, who was indicted on corruption charges in Colombia, alongside Shakira's then lawyer, José María Michavila (Rodríguez 2009). ALAS's original mission was to fund programs to help needy children. Its stated mission today, however, is to be a social movement that does not fund programs (América Latina en Acción Solidaria 2013). The Foundation's only achievements seem to have been two megaconcerts, held on 17 May 2008: Shakira and others artists performed in Buenos Aires, before 180,000 people; in Mexico City, Ricky Martin and others performed before an estimated live audience of 200,000 people ('Reunió concierto ALAS a 380 mil personas en

México y Argentina' [ALAS concerts unite 380 thousand people in Mexico and Argentina] 2008). Neither concert was followed with the promised schools in poor parts of Buenos Aires or Mexico City, despite commitments of USD 200 million from the Mexican Carlos Slim Helú, then the world's richest person, and Howard Buffett, son of the noted US philanthropist Warren Buffett; but both concerts did bolster the celebrity status of the stars involved (Palm 2009; Rodríguez 2009). By 2009, it was clear that the ALAS enterprise had generated a transnational philanthropy scandal involving five countries: Argentina, Colombia, Costa Rica, Spain and Panama (Palm 2009). Controversies and transnational court cases in part related to ALAS have continued. De la Rúa sued Shakira for USD 100 million in September 2012 as purported compensation for sacrificing his own career to support Shakira's rise to musical superstardom (Farrés 2013; see also Moreno 2012).

Since separating from De la Rúa Shakira subsequently met and became romantically involved with the Catalan soccer player Gerard Piqué, who plays for Futbal Club Barcelona. This relationship has enabled Shakira to distance herself from the ALAS fall out, given that she, Piqué and their son Milan are now irrevocably part of Spanish and European celebrity discourse. Renewed media interest in Shakira in the USA occurred at the same time with her role as a judge on the US TV music competition, 'The Voice', in 2013 and 2014 (Cruz and Muñoz 2013). Yet, despite that shift in Shakira's mass-mediated well-being, the journalistic laying bare of ALAS's financial problems raises the question: how might the impact and effectiveness of celanthropic latinidad be measured and assessed?

Celanthropic latinidad on the ground

While dealing with intense media scrutiny and journalistic sleuthing for celebrity scandal fodder, Shakira and Ricky Martin have raised public awareness in numerous countries about the global traffic in children, and the importance of early childhood literacy, nutrition and healthcare as paths out of poverty. This

suggests that their celanthropy function rests on their capacities to influence socioeconomic change. They do not simply raise international awareness of the issues they care about. They can also request commitments from key political, NGO, corporate and celebrity social actors with the requisite financial and political capital to effect on-the-ground change (t Hart and Tindall 2009). That approach may reflect how celanthropic latinidad could be signalling a Latin American-modulated mode of doing philanthropy that conjoins Bishop's (2008) notion of 'Northern' celebrity philanthropy with Latin American traditions among middle- and upper-classes of helping out, charity and community service.

In this Shakira and Martin appear to conform to journalist Nancy Gibbs' argument (2005) that the philanthropy they practice, nationally and internationally, is characterized by an effective drive to provide a material basis on which the most marginalized denizens of Latin American and other states may gain some socioeconomic leverage on the arduous trajectory away from poverty and labour exploitation. Moreover, Shakira and Martin have proved adept at corralling representatives of national governments, including a host of Presidents and Prime Ministers, non-government organizations, multinational companies, the United Nations and UNICEF, not to mention millions of their fans, into supporting their philanthropic visions.

For their part, Matthew Bishop and Michael Green (2010: xi) include Shakira as part of the select roster of celebrities who are spearheading the new 'philanthrocapitalism', which they define as a movement among the super-rich 'focused on tackling the world's toughest problems through effective giving'. They also laud her for her 'impressive philanthrocapitalistic brand' ('Did it work?' 2011). As many journalists have discovered, Shakira's so-called 'brand' has such import that Presidents and other government officials from countries across Latin America, the super-rich in the USA and Latin America, and even the King of Spain, regularly appear at events she has organized, or been involved with, in her quest to ensure that children from Colombia and other states will be educated and provided with health care (Bishop 2008; Malcomson 2009). To date,

Shakira's Barefoot Foundation has funded eight schools in Colombia (Cobo 2014), and claims to ensure that 5,000-plus children annually receive an education from day care through to primary and secondary levels (fundacionpiesdescalzos.com). The Foundation has also expanded its operations into Haiti and South Africa, and now claims to be teaching some 30,000 children annually in three countries (fundacionpiesdescalzos.com).

While the Ricky Martin Foundation has yet to release data on the numbers of children it has assisted, it is also clear that the Foundation's Global Awareness initiative is predicated on utilizing celebrities as so-called 'popular educators' raising international awareness of the traffic in children: 'Global Awareness enables us to inform the world of this heinous crime and mobilize people by participating in forums, workshops, media interventions and advocacy efforts. Working in partnership as well as by following a multi-sector alliance model involving civil society, inter-governmental organizations, and the private sector solidifies our mission. To be effective in our goal we advocate for the prevention and protection of this most vulnerable segment of the population against all forms of exploitation' (rickymartinfoundation n.d.). That 'multi-sector alliance model' has seen Martin's Foundation team up with numerous partners. In a short piece Martin (2012) wrote for the Foundation's website, 'Stop the scourge of child trafficking', for example, he names the following collaborators on the Foundation's Call and Live project, 'the first regional campaign to combat human trafficking in the Americas': UNICEF, the Habitat for Humanity, Johns Hopkins University's Protection Project, the University of Puerto Rico, Save the Children, RTL Foundation, the InterAmerican Development Bank, the Trafficking In Persons Office, SAP, Doral Bank, Microsoft, and the International Organization for Migration. That is an impressive roster. One legal historian, Virginia Garrard (2006: 148), credits the Ricky Martin Foundation with playing a pivotal celanthropic role in not simply raising to public consciousness in the USA and elsewhere the facts of contemporary trafficking in, and slavery of, children, but, more effectively, in keeping the issue on the policy agenda of successive US administrations.

It is useful to end this discussion with the public statements Shakira and Ricky Martin made in April and May 2010 about pending legislation in Arizona, the now infamous Senate Bill 1070, which allowed Arizona police to detain anyone in that US state perceived to be an illegal alien. In response to one of the most draconian pieces of anti-immigrant legislation ever proposed in the USA – it is now law, though being contested at the Supreme Court level, and is influencing legislation in other US states – the artists again appealed to their status as Latinos in opposing the measure. At the award ceremony for the Billboard Prizes for Latin Music held in Puerto Rico in 2010, Martin declared that Arizona's largely Mexican-origin Latino population was 'not alone', and called for an end to such discriminatory legislation (Note 2010). Shakira traveled to the Arizona capital, Phoenix, to express her critique of legislation that she regarded as contravening 'our civil rights' (Note 2010). Of Shakira's statements since 2010, one Latino journalist concludes: 'The Colombian superstar has hits worldwide, and has used her influence in a variety of ways, including working to influence the [US] immigration debate. She took on SB 1070 as being unfair to families and leaving the vulnerable open to abuse' (Mussall 2012). Once again, and notwithstanding critiques from US Latinos about Latin American celebrities appropriating latinidades, those celebrities' public opposition to racially determined antiimmigration legislation in Arizona cannot be dismissed lightly. They indicate that the artists' global celanthropy functions in pan-ethnic Latino solidarity terms meaningful in the US setting, yet resonating transnationally, and meaningfully, beyond that state.

Conclusion

There is no question that when it comes to the celebrity functions of philanthropists, we are embroiled in the messy operations of the global mass-media apparatus that produces celebrities for popular consumption, and the equally messy operations of globalization and its capitalist foundations that underwrite the media apparatus as well (see also Bell; Millington; and Van den

Bulck, Claessens and Panis, in this volume). Yet equally it is too neat and simplistic to dismiss the philanthropic work of figures such as Shakira and Ricky Martin as only serving the interests of, and benefiting from, the celebrity-generating branches of that apparatus. As the fate of ALAS has demonstrated, celanthropy also poses risks to the celebrities involved in terms of damaged brands and personal reputations (see Jeffreys, in this volume).

More to the point, Shakira's and Ricky Martin's celebrity and philanthropy are best understood as related historical products of capitalism, the mass media in two global languages at least, and the legacies of underdevelopment and transbordered community aspirations in the Americas. An understanding of celebrity philanthropy as formed, critiqued in, and from, the so-called global North is inadequate in grappling with celanthropy that is clearly also anchored in the global South. Perhaps the most important conclusion to be drawn from Shakira's and Martin's celanthropic latinidad, therefore is that clearcut distinctions between the so-called global North and South are rendered nonsensical when the celebrities themselves enjoy a privileged homeliness across multiple national, cultural and linguistic borders. Indeed, the artists' pragmatic if controversial embrace of a US Latino identification does not simply highlight the transformations of US-based latinidades into new transnational discourses of affiliation. Those transformations indicate the need to question many of the discursive assumptions about celebrity formation and celanthropic enterprise, particularly when conceived as emanating from and operating in the global North and/or in English only.

Acknowledgements

This research was supported under the Australian Research Council's Discovery Projects (DP0985710) funding schemes. I would also like to thank my collaborator Elaine Jeffreys, who has truly endured a co-editing burden from hell in this enterprise, and the contributors to this wonderful collection, for their patience and goodwill.

References

'A letter from Shakira' (2014) Barefoot Foundation, http://www.fundacionpiesdescalzos.com/barefootfundation/pages/about/about_founder_en.php. Accessed 17 April 2014.

Allatson, P. (2004) *Latino Dreams: Transcultural Traffic and the U.S. National Imaginary*. Amsterdam and New York: Rodopi.

Allatson, P. (2007) *Key Terms in Latino/a Cultural and Literary Studies*, Malden, MA, and Oxford: Blackwell.

América Latina en Acción Solidaria (ALAS) (2013) Official website, Spanish-language version, http://www.fundacionalas.org/en, English-language version, http://www.fundacionalas.org/es/. Accessed 17 April 2014.

Aparicio, F.R., and Chávez-Silverman, S. (eds) (1997) *Tropicalizations: Transcultural Representations of Latinidad*, Hanover, NH: University Press of New England.

Ayers, D. (2011) 'Making babies: Cultural response to gay celebrity dads', *The Back Lot*, January 3, http://www.thebacklot.com/making-babies-cultural-response-to-gay-celebrity-dads/01/2011/. Accessed 17 April 2014.

Ball, E., Lowe, J., and Phillips, E. (eds) (2002) *Abriendo caminos: Strengthening Latino Communities through Giving and Volunteering*, New York: Hispanic Federation.

Beltrán, M.C. (2009) *Latina/o Stars in U.S. Eyes: The Makings and Meanings of TV Stardom*, University of Illinois Press, Urbana and Chicago.

Bishop, M. (2008) 'On the road with Shakira: Making philanthropy contagious', *Intelligent Life Magazine*, Autumn, 16 October,

http://moreintelligentlife.com/story/on-the-road-with-shakira. Accessed 17 April 2014.

Bishop, M., and Green, M. (2010) *Philanthrocapitalism: How Giving Can Save the World*, London: A & C Black Publishers.

Brockington, D. (2014) 'The production and construction of celebrity advocacy in international development', *Third World Quarterly*, 35, 1: pp. 88–108.

Caminero-Santangelo, M. (2007) On Latinidad: U.S. Latino Literature and the Construction of Ethnicity, Gainesville: University of Florida Press.

Campoamor, D., Diaz, W., and Ramos, H. (1999) *Nuevos Senderos: Reflections on Hispanics and Philanthropy*, Houston: Arte Público Press.

Cepeda, M.E. (2000) 'Mucho loco for Ricky Martin; or the politics of chronology, crossover, and language within the Latin(o) music "boom", *Popular Music and Society*, 24, 3: pp. 55–71.

Cepeda, M.E. (2010) Musical ImagiNation: U.S.-Colombian Identity and the Latin Music Boom, New York: New York University Press.

Cervantes, A. (2003). 'Hometown Associations as catalysts for the development of community foundation: The Zacatecan Case', Center on Philanthropy and Civil Society, May, The Graduate Center, City University of New York.

Cobo, L. (2011) 'Shakira: The Barranquilla bombshell moves easily between the worlds of entertainment and philanthropy', *Poder360° Magazine*, November, http://www.poder360.com/article_detail.php?id_article=6166. Accessed 17 April 2014.

Cobo, L. (2014) 'Shakira opens new school in Colombia: "We can change lives", Latin Notes, Billboard, 25 February,

http://www.billboard.com/articles/columns/latin-notas/5915715/shakira-opens-new-school-in-colombia-we-can-change-lives. Accessed 2 March 2014.

Colapinto, J. (2012) 'Looking good: The new boom in celebrity philanthropy', *New Yorker*, March 26: pp. 56–64.

Cooper, A. (2007) Celebrity Diplomacy, Boulder; London: Paradigm Publishers.

Cortes, M. (1995) 'Three strategic questions about Latino philanthropy', *New Directions for Philanthropic Fundraising*, 8: pp. 23–40.

Cottle, S., and Nolan, D. (2007) 'Global humanitarianism and the changing aidmedia field', *Journalism Studies*, 8, 6: pp. 862–78.

Cruz, F., and Muñoz, P. (2013) 'Shakira presume de hijo en las redes socials' [Shakira shows off her son on social networks], *MSN famosos*, June 20, http://mujer.es.msn.com/famosos/shakira-y-pique-bebe-milan. Accessed 17 April 2014.

De la Garza, R. (1997) Latino Subgroups and Their Attitudes Towards Philanthropy: A Comparison Among Them and with Non-Latinos, Austin: University of Texas at Austin.

'Did it work?' (2011) Philanthrocapitalism, 21 December, http://www.philanthrocapitalism.net/2011/12/did-it-work/. Accessed 1 December 2012.

Dieter, H., and Kumar, K. (2008) 'The downside of celebrity diplomacy: The neglected complexity of development', *Global Governance*, 14, pp. 259–64.

'Discurso de Shakira en la Cumbre de las Américas' [Shakira's speech at the Summit of the Americas] (2012) Shakira.com official website, http://es.shakira.com/news/title/discurso-de-shakira-en-la-cumbre-de-las-amricas-domingo. Accessed 6 December 2012.

Ennis, S., Ríos-Vargas, M., and Albert, G. (2011) 'The Hispanic population: 2010', US Department of Commerce, Economics and Statistics Administration, US Census Bureau, http://www.census.gov/prod/cen2010/briefs/c2010br-04.pdf. Accessed 8 July 2012.

Falcón, A. (2001) 'Liberating Vieques', *The Nation*, 9 July, http://www.thenation.com/article/liberating-vieques#. Accessed 15 December 2013.

Farrés, C. (2013) 'Los Puig "echan" a Fernando de la Rúa y a su hijo Antonio, ex de Shakira' [The Los Puig family reject Fernando de la Rúa and his son Antonio, Shakira's ex], *Economia digital* (España), 28 de enero, http://www.economiadigital.es/es/notices/2013/01/los_puig_echan_a_fernando_d e_la_rua_y_a_su_hijo_antonio_ex_de_shakira_37500.php. Accessed 17 April 2014.

Fiol-Matta, L. (2002) 'Pop Latinidad: Puerto Ricans in the Latin explosion, 1999', *Centro Journal*, 14, 1: pp. 27–51.

Foucault, M. (1977) 'What is an author?', in D.F. Bouchard (ed.) *Language*, *Counter-Memory*, *Practice: Selected Essays and Interviews*, Ithaca: Cornell University Press, pp. 113–38.

Fuchs, C. (2007) 'There's my territory: Shakira crossing over', in M. Mendible (ed.) *From Bananas to Buttocks: The Latina Body in Popular Film and Culture*, Austin: University of Texas Press, pp. 167–82.

Fundación Pies Descalzos (2010) Official website, Spanish-language version, http://www.fundacionpiesdescalzos.com/; English-language version, http://www.fundacionpiesdescalzos.com/en/home.html. Accessed 30 January 2014.

Fundación Ricky Martin (2013) Official website, Spanish-language version, http://www.rickymartinfoundation.org/es/; English-language version, http://www.rickymartinfoundation.org/. Accessed 30 January 2014.

Galaz, M. (2011) 'El gobierno concede a Ricky Martin la nacionalidad española para poder casarse' [The government grants Spanish citizenship to Ricky Martin so he can marry], *El País*, 4 November,

http://www.elpais.com/articulo/gente/tv/gobierno/concede/Ricky/Martin/nacionali dad/espanola/poder/casarse/elpepugen/20111104elpepuage_3/Tes. Accessed 17 April 2014.

Gallegos, H. E., and O'Neill, M. (eds) (1991) *Hispanics and the Nonprofit Sector*, New York: The Foundation Center.

Garrard, V. (2006) 'Sad stories: Trafficking in children—unique situations requiring new solutions', *Georgia Journal of International and Comparative Law*, 35: 147–73.

Gibbs, N. (2005) 'The good samaritans', *Time*, 19 December, http://www.time.com/time/magazine/article/0,9171,1142278,00.html. Accessed 20 March 2014.

Gonzales, S.A. (1985) *Hispanic American Voluntary Organizations*, Westport, CT: Greenwood Press.

Grandin, G. (2006) *Empire's Workshop: Latin America, the United States, and the Rise of the New Imperialism*, New York: Metropolitan Books.

Gray, K. (2011) 'Shakira helps rebuild quake-hit Haiti girls school', Reuters, 31 March, http://www.reuters.com/article/2011/03/31/us-shakira-haiti-idUSTRE72U7ZF20110331. Accessed 17 April 2014.

Howard, C. (2013) 'The World's Most Powerful Women 2013', *Forbes Magazine*, 22 May, http://www.forbes.com/sites/carolinehoward/2013/05/22/theworlds-most-powerful-women-2013/. Accessed 16 April 2014.

Kapoor, I. (2012) *Celebrity Humanitarianism: The Ideology of Global Charity*, Abingdon, Oxon: Routledge.

Kurshan, N. (2013) 'America's own political prisoners', *Counterpunch*, December 16, http://www.counterpunch.org/2013/12/16/americas-own-political-prisoners/. Accessed 17 April 2014.

'Latino philanthropy literature review' (2003) Donor Research Project, Center on Philanthropy and Civil Society, City University of New York, http://www.philanthropy.org/programs/literature_reviews/latino_lit_review.pdf. Accessed 17 April 2014.

Malcomson, S. (2009) 'Shakira's children', *New York Times*, 2 June, http://www.nytimes.com/2009/06/07/magazine/07Shakira-t.html?_r=0&ref=magazine&pagewanted=all. Accessed 17 April 2014.

Martin, R. (2010) Me, New York: Celebra.

Martin, R. (2012) 'Stop the scourge of child trafficking', Ricky Martin Foundation, 6 June, http://www.rickymartinfoundation.org/. Accessed 8 January 2014.

Miranda, J. (1999) 'Religion, philanthropy, and the Hispanic people in North America', *New Directions for Philanthropic Fundraising*, 24: 59–74.

Moreno, C. (2012) 'Antonio de la Rúa, Shakira's ex-boyfriend, sues star for \$250 million', *Huffington Post*, 6 September,

http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2012/09/06/antonio-de-la-rua-sues-shakira_n_1859324.html. Accessed 17 April 2014.

Musall, J. (2012) 'Latino celebrities at vanguard of massive, developing political bloc: What are some past immigration actions by Latino celebrities?', *Voices*, http://voices.yahoo.com/shared/print.shtml?content_type=article&content_type_id =8013699. Accessed 17 April 2014.

Negrón-Muntaner, F. (2004) *Boricua Pop: Puerto Ricans and the Latinization of American Culture*, New York; London: New York University Press.

Note, J. (2010) 'Shakira, Ricky Martin, Juanes y Paulina Rubio contra la ley de Arizona' [Shakira, Ricky Martin, Juanes y Paulina Rubio against the Arizona law], *Diario Femenino*, 1 de mayo,

http://www.diariofemenino.com/actualidad/sociedad/articulos/shakira-ricky-martin-juanes-paulina-rubio-ley-arizona/. Accessed 17 April 2014.

Nuiry, O.E. (1992). 'Give and take', *Hispanic*, April: pp. 18–24.

Palm, M. (2009) 'Directivos de ALAS, en trama de corrupción en España' [ALAS executives in a web of corruption in Spain], *Prensa* (Pánama), 10 de marzo, http://mensual.prensa.com/mensual/contenido/2009/03/10/hoy/panorama/1718112 .asp. Accessed 17 April 2014.

'Presidentes Obama y Santos y Shakira hablaron en la Cumbre de las Américas' [President Obama, President Santos and Shakira spoke at the Summit of the

Americas] (2012) Shakira.com, http://es.shakira.com/news/title/presidentes-obama-y-santos-y-shakira-hablaron-en-la-cumbre-de-las-amricas. Accessed 8 August 2013.

Ramos, H.A.J. (1999) 'Latino philanthropy: Expanding US models of giving and civic participation', in *Cultures of Caring: Philanthropy in Diverse American Communities*, Washington DC: Council on Foundations.

Ramos, Z. (2012) 'Ricky Martin: Puerto Rico needs a "serious" statehood plebiscite', *Huffington Post*, 30 November, http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2012/11/30/ricky-martin-puerto-rico-statehood_n_2220097.html. Accessed 17 April 2014.

'Reunió concierto ALAS a 380 mil personas en México y Argentina' [ALAS concerts unite 380 thousand people in Mexico and Argentina] (2008) Eluniversal.mx, May 18, http://www.eluniversal.com.mx/notas/507601.html. Accessed 10 May 2010.

'Ricky Martin and Habitat's CEO, Jonathan Reckford, travel to Haiti in support of Habitat's Haitian recovery efforts' (2010) Habitat for Humanity, 19 January, http://www.habitat.org/newsroom/2010archive/01_19_2010_ricky_martin_recovery_fund.aspx. Accessed 14 April 2014.

Rodríguez, G. (2009) 'La última trampa de Antonito' [Little Antonio's latest fraud], *InfoNews: Un mundo, muchas voces* (Argentina), 18 de abril, http://www.infonews.com/nota.php?id=37253&bienvenido=1. Accessed 17 April 2014.

Rojas, E. (2013) "Spitting phlegm at the system": The changing voices of anticolonial Puerto Rican protest music', in E. Rojas and L. Michie (eds) *Sounds of Resistance: The Role of Music in Multicultural Activism*, vol. 2, Santa Barbara, CA: Praeger, pp. 491–592.

Ronderos, J.G. (2003) 'The war on drugs and the military: The case of Colombia', in M.E. Beare (ed), *Critical Reflections on Transnational Organized Crime*, *Money Laundering and Corruption*, Toronto: University of Toronto Press, pp. 207–36.

Sanborn, C.A. 'Philanthropy in Latin America: Historical traditions and current trends', in S. Sanborn and F. Portocarrero (eds), *Philanthropy and Social Change in Latin America*, Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, pp. 3–30.

Sanborn, C. and Portocarrero, F. (eds) (2005) *Philanthropy and Social Change in Latin America*, Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Sandoval-Sánchez, A. (2003) 'Latinos and cultural exchange de-facing mainstream magazine covers: The new faces of Latino/a transnational and transcultural Celebrities', *Encrucijada/Crossroads: An Online Academic Journal*, 1, 1: 13–24.

Shakira (2013) 'My 40 chances: A lifelong commitment to helping others', 40 Chances, June 26, http://www.40chances.com/blog/shakira-my-40-chances/. Accessed 17 April 2014.

Shakira.com Official website (n.d.) http://www.shakira.com/index.php (English version); http://es.shakira.com/ (Spanish version). Accessed 15 November 2012.

'Shakira has the most-"liked" page on Facebook' (2014) ABC News Online, March 24, http://abcnews.go.com/Entertainment/shakira-page-facebook/story?id=23042406. Accessed 25 March 2014.

Sulek, M. (2010) 'On the modern meaning of philanthropy', *Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Quarterly*, 39, 2: 193–212.

't Hart, P. and Tindall, K. (2009) 'Leadership by the famous: Celebrity as political capital', in J. Kane, H. Patapan and P. 't Hart (eds) *Dispersed Democratic Leadership: Origins, Dynamics, and Implications*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 255–78.

The 2009 Index of Global Philanthropy and Remittances (2009) Center for Global Prosperity, Hudson Institute,

http://www.hudson.org/content/researchattachments/attachment/979/index_of_global_philanthropy_and_remittances_2009.pdf. Accessed 17 April 2014.

Tsaliki, L., Frangonikolopoulos, C.A., and Huliaras, A. (2011) *Transnational Celebrity Activism in Global Politics*, Bristol, UK; Chicago USA: Intellect Press.

Twitter Counter (2013) 'The top 100 users', http://twittercounter.com/pages/100/10. Accessed 16 December 2013.

Valdivia, A.N. (ed.) (2008) *Latina/o Communication Studies Today*, New York: Peter Lang.

Watson, T. (2008) 'Global philanthropy Part 2: Philanthropy in Latin America: Past traditions, future innovations', On Philanthropy, 6 March, http://onphilanthropy.com/2008/global-philanthropy-part-2-philanthropy-in-latin-america-past-traditions-future-innovations/. Accessed 17 April 2014.

West, D.M. (2007) *Angelina, Mia, and Bono: Celebrities and International Development*, Washington D.C.: The Brookings Institution.

Yaffe, L. (2011) 'Conflicto armado en Colombia: análisis de las causas económicas, sociales e institucionales de la oposición violenta' [Armed conflict in Colombia: Analysis of the economic, social and institutional causes of violent opposition], *CS en Ciencias Sociales*, 8: 187–208,

http://www.icesi.edu.co/revistas/index.php/revista_cs/article/view/1133/1509. Accessed 17 April 2014.